

**BEFORE THE BOARD OF ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY
STATE OF IDAHO**

IN THE MATTER OF AIR QUALITY
PERMIT TO CONSTRUCT P-2019.0047

NEZ PERCE TRIBE, IDAHO
CONSERVATION LEAGUE, and SAVE
THE SOUTH FORK SALMON,

Petitioners,

v.

IDAHO DEPARTMENT OF
ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY,

Respondent,

and

PERPETUA RESOURCES IDAHO, INC.,
Intervenor-Respondent.

Agency Case No. 0101-22-01

OAH Case No. 23-245-01

CORRECTED AGENCY RECORD AND TRANSCRIPTS

Petition for Board Review from the Office of Administrative Hearings
Dylan Lawrence, Hearing Officer, Presiding

RAÚL R. LABRADOR
Attorney General

SCOTT L. CAMPBELL
Deputy Attorney General
Chief, Energy and Natural Resources Division

Hannah M.C. Young
Michael A. Short
Deputy Attorney General
Department of Environmental Quality
1410 N. Hilton, 2nd Floor
Boise, Idaho 83706
Telephone: (208)373-0494
hannah.young@deq.idaho.gov
michael.short@deq.idaho.gov

*Attorneys for Respondent Department of
Environmental Quality*

Krista K. McIntyre
W. Christopher Pooser
Wade C. Foster
Nicole C. Hancock
STOEL RIVES LLP
101 S. Capitol Blvd., Ste. 1900
Boise, Idaho 83702
Telephone: (208)389-9000
krista.mcintyre@stoel.com
christopher.pooser@stoel.com
wade.foster@stoel.com
nicole.hancock@stoel.com

*Attorneys for Intervenor-Respondent Perpetua
Resources Idaho, Inc.*

Bryan Hurlbutt
Laurence (“Laird”) J. Lucas
ADVOCATES FOR THE WEST
P.O. Box 1612
Boise, Idaho 83701
Telephone: (208)342-7024
bhurlbutt@advocateswest.org
llucas@advocateswest.org

*Attorneys for Petitioners Nez Perce Tribe and
Idaho Conservation League*

Julia Thrower
MOUNTAIN TOP LAW PLLC
614 Thompson Ave.
McCall, Idaho 83638
Telephone: (208)271-6503
jthrower@mtntoplw.com

*Attorneys for Petitioner Save the South Fork
Salmon*

**CORRECTED AGENCY RECORD AND TRANSCRIPTS
SUMMARY | MAY 15, 2024**

Agency record documents are stamped with sequential REC page numbers. Documents 095 through 105 were stamped with out-of-sequence page numbers resulting in duplicative REC numbers.

The agency record and Table of Contents have been corrected by adding the correct page numbers for documents 095 through 105 and identifying them as C-REC on the documents and in the Table of Contents. The out-of-sequence/duplicative numbers have also been retained on the documents and in the Table of Contents for future reference as the incorrect REC numbers may have been referred to and cited in documents filed between January 30, 2024, and May 9, 2024.

When referring to the corrected agency record documents for future filings, cite to C-REC page numbers.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CORRECTED AGENCY RECORD AND TRANSCRIPTS

Prepared by the Department of Environmental Quality

Current as of October 7, 2024

In the Matter of Permit to Construct Issued to Perpetua Resources Idaho, Inc.

Agency Case No. 0101-22-01

OAH Case No. 23-245-01

	Table of Contents	i - vii
TRANSCRIPTS		
	Transcript – September 21, 2023 Summary Judgment Hearing	TR 0001 - 0057
	Transcript – March 14, 2024 Board Meeting Oral Argument	TR 0058 - 0155
	Transcript – May 1, 2024 Board Meeting	TR 0156 - 0174
	Transcript – June 12, 2024 Board Meeting	TR 0175 - 0182
AGENCY RECORD		
001	Petition to Initiate Contested Case: Air Quality Permit to Construct P-2019.0047 (Jun. 17, 2022), July 22, 2022	REC 0001 - 0028
002	Notice of Filing and Service of Petition , July 22, 2022	REC 0029 - 0030
003	Notice of Appointment of Hearing Officer , July 28, 2022	REC 0031- 0032
004	Response to Petition to Initiate Contested Case: Air Permit to Construct P-2019.0047 (Jun. 17, 2022), August 12, 2022	REC 0033 - 0039
005	Petition to Intervene , August 12, 2022	REC 0040 - 0043
006	Order Approving Petition to Intervene , August 22, 2022	REC 0044 - 0045
007	Notice of Prehearing Conference , August 23, 2022	REC 0046 - 0048
008	Notice of Appearance , September 6, 2022	REC 0049 - 0051
009	Perpetua's Motion to Dismiss and Supporting Brief , September 6, 2022	REC 0052 - 0121
010	Notice of Joinder , September 12, 2022	REC 0122 - 0124
011	Petitioners' Opposition to Perpetua's Motion to Dismiss , September 20, 2022	REC 0125 - 0142
012	Prehearing Order , September 23, 2022	REC 0143 - 0146

013	Notice of Virtual Status Conference , September 27, 2022	REC 0147 - 0148
014	Order on Status Conference; Notice of Status Conference , October 14, 2022	REC 0149 - 0154
015	Order on Status Conference; Notice of Status Conference , October 28, 2022	REC 0155 - 1059
016	Order on Motion to Dismiss , November 15, 2022	REC 0160 - 0186
017	Order on Status Conference , November 30, 2022	REC 0187 - 0189
018	Motion to File First Amended Petition to Initiate Contested Case , December 6, 2022	REC 0190 - 0193
019	First Amended Petition to Initiate Contested Case , December 6, 2022	REC 0194 - 0223
020	Perpetua's Notice of Non-Opposition to Motion to File First Amended Petition to Initiate Contested Case , December 13, 2022	REC 0224 - 0226
021	Perpetua's Response to First Amended Petition to Initiate Contested Case , December 13, 2022	REC 0227 - 0243
022	Notice of Reassignment of Pending Matters , December 19, 2022	REC 0244 - 0248
023	Notice of Appointment of Hearing Officer , January 3, 2023	REC 0249 - 0254
024	Order Granting Motion to File First Amended Petition , January 6, 2023	REC 0255 - 0257
025	Notice of Status Conference , January 10, 2023	REC 0258 - 0262
026	First Amended Petition to Initiate Contested Case , January 11, 2023	REC 0263 - 0292
027	Joint Motion to Enter Stipulated Scheduling Order , January 13, 2023	REC 0293 - 0295
028	Response to First Amended Petition to Initiate Contested Case , January 17, 2023	REC 0296 - 0302
029	Scheduling Order , January 19, 2023	REC 0303 - 0306
030	Respondent's Motion to Extend Deadline for Discovery and Modify the Scheduling Order Dated January 19, 2023 , February 9, 2023	REC 0307 - 0309
031	Order Granting Motion to Extend Deadline , February 13, 2023	REC 0310 - 0312
032	Respondent's Notice of Discovery Service , February 14, 2023	REC 0313 - 0315

033	Respondent's Notice of Discovery Service , February 21, 2023	REC 0316 - 0318
034	Petitioners' Motion for Summary Judgment , April 14, 2023	REC 0319 - 0322
035	Petitioners' Opening Brief in Support of Motion for Summary Judgment , April 14, 2023	REC 0323 - 0363
036	Declaration of Bryan Hurlbutt , April 14, 2023	REC 0364 - 1203
037	DEQ's Cross Motion for Summary Judgment , May 12, 2023	REC 1204 - 1206
038	DEQ's Response to Petitioners' Motion for Summary Judgment and Brief in Support of Cross Motion for Summary Judgment , May 12, 2023	REC 1207 - 1232
039	Declaration of Kevin Schilling , May 12, 2023	REC 1233 - 1255
040	Declaration of Mike Simon , May 12, 2023	REC 1256 - 1270
041	Declaration of Tiffany Floyd , May 12, 2023	REC 1271 - 1275
042	Intervenor-Respondent's Motion for Summary Judgment , May 12, 2023	REC 1276 - 1278
043	Memorandum in Support of Intervenor-Respondent's Motion for Summary Judgment and in Opposition to Petitioners' Motion for Summary Judgment , May 12, 2023	REC 1279 - 1336
044	Declaration of W. Christopher Pooser in Support of Intervenor-Respondent's Motion for Summary Judgment , May 12, 2023	REC 1337 - 2316
045	Petitioners' Response to DEQ's Cross-Motion for Summary Judgment and Intervenor Perpetua's Motion for Summary Judgment and Petitioner's Reply in Support of Petitioners' Motion for Summary Judgment , June 9, 2023	REC 2317 - 2371
046	Declaration of Allison Fowle , June 9, 2023	REC 2372 - 2377
047	Declaration of Drew Hollenback , June 9, 2023	REC 2378 - 2384
048	Declaration of Asa Menlove , June 9, 2023	REC 2385 - 2389
049	Declaration of Joseph Oatman , June 9, 2023	REC 2390 - 2394
050	Declaration of Jonathan Oppenheimer , June 9, 2023	REC 2395 - 2538
051	Declaration of Zak Sears , June 9, 2023	REC 2539 - 2547
052	Declaration of Emmitt Taylor Jr. , June 9, 2023	REC 2548 - 2554

053	Declaration of Julia Thrower , June 9, 2023	REC 2555 - 2985
054	Respondent's Non-Reply to Petitioners' Response , June 23, 2023	REC 2986 - 2988
055	Reply Memorandum in Support of Intervenor-Respondent Perpetua's Motion for Summary Judgment , June 23, 2023	REC 2989 - 3023
056	Declaration of Kevin Lewis in Support of Intervenor-Respondent Perpetua's Reply in Support of Motion for Summary Judgment , June 23, 2023	REC 3024 - 3028
057	Intervenor-Respondent Perpetua's Motion to Strike , June 23, 2023	REC 3029 - 3034
058	Notice of Status and Scheduling Conference , July 7, 2023	REC 3035 - 3039
059	Opposition to Perpetua's Motion to Strike Oppenheimer Declaration , July 7, 2023	REC 3040 - 3049
060	Petitioners' Motion to Strike Declaration of Kevin Lewis and Brief in Support , July 7, 2023	REC 3050 - 3055
061	Order and Notice from Status and Scheduling Conference , July 12, 2023	REC 3056 - 3058
062	Intervenor-Respondent's Reply in Support of Motion to Strike Oppenheimer Declaration , July 14, 2023	REC 3059 - 3064
063	Intervenor-Respondent's Opposition to Petitioners' Motion to Strike Declaration of Kevin Lewis , July 14, 2023	REC 3065 - 3072
064	Petitioners' Reply in Support of Motion to Strike Declaration of Kevin Lewis , July 20, 2023	REC 3073 - 3078
065	Order on Perpetua's Motion to Strike , July 31, 2023	REC 3079 - 3085
066	Order on Petitioners' Motion to Strike , July 31, 2023	REC 3086 - 3091
067	Notice Pursuant to IRAP 412 , August 8, 2023	REC 3092 - 3096
068	Joint Motion in Limine to Exclude Communications from U.S. EPA Sent After Permit was Issued , August 28, 2023	REC 3097 - 3103
069	Joint Motion to Shorten Time and for Expedited Consideration , August 31, 2023	REC 3104 - 3107
070	Petitioners' Motion to Stay the Case and Brief in Support , September 1, 2023	REC 3108 - 3136

071	Petitioners' Motion to Supplement with August 10, 2023 EPA Letter and Brief in Support , September 1, 2023	REC 3137 - 3166
072	Scheduling Order on Motions Related to Recent EPA Letter , September 6, 2023	REC 3167 - 3171
073	Petitioners' Response in Opposition to Motion in Limine , September 8, 2023	REC 3172 - 3189
074	Petitioners' Motion to Amend Contested Case Petition , September 8, 2023	REC 3190 - 3235
075	Joint Opposition to Petitioners' Motion to Amend Contested Case Petition , September 11, 2023	REC 3236 - 3242
076	Joint Response in Opposition to Petitioners' Motion to Supplement with August 10, 2023 EPA Letter , September 11, 2023	REC 3243 - 3250
077	Joint Response in Opposition to Petitioners' Motion to Stay the Case , September 11, 2023	REC 3251 - 3258
078	Declaration of Tiffany Floyd Opposing the Motion to Stay , September 11, 2023	REC 3259 - 3264
079	Order on Motions Related to Recent EPA Letter , September 15, 2023	REC 3265 - 3274
080	Notice Regarding Summary Judgment Hearing , September 15, 2023	REC 3275 - 3279
081	Memorandum Decision on Motions for Summary Judgment and Preliminary Order , October 31, 2023	REC 3280 - 3328
082	Notice of Substitution of Counsel , November 2, 2023	REC 3329 - 3331
083	Joint Motion for Reconsideration and/or Clarification , November 10, 2023	REC 3332 - 3334
084	Memorandum in Support of Joint Motion for Reconsideration and/or Clarification , November 10, 2023	REC 3335 - 3341
085	Petition for Review of Preliminary Order , November 14, 2023	REC 3342 - 3356
086	Order on Post Preliminary Order Procedures , November 17, 2023	REC 3357 - 3360
087	Petitioners' Response to Joint Motion for Reconsideration and/or Clarification , November 20, 2023	REC 3361 - 3366

088	Order on Joint Motion for Reconsideration and/or Clarification , December 5, 2023	REC 3367 - 3371
089	Amended Memorandum Decision on Motions for Summary Judgment and Preliminary Order , December 5, 2023	REC 3372 - 3425
090	Amended Petition for Review of Preliminary Orders , December 15, 2023	REC 3426 - 3441
091	Certification and Transmittal of Agency Record and Transcript , December 15, 2023	REC 3442 - 3444
092	Notice of Briefing Schedule , December 27, 2023	REC 3445 - 3447
093	Notice of Oral Argument , January 9, 2024	REC 3448 - 3450
094	Petitioners' Opening Brief in Support of Amended Petition for Review of Preliminary Orders , January 17, 2024	REC 3451 - 3508
095	Amended Notice of Oral Argument , January 30, 2024	REC 3059 – 3061 C-REC 3509 - 3511
096	Respondent Idaho Department of Environmental Quality's Brief and Response to Petitioners' Opening Brief , February 7, 2024	REC 3062 – 3095 C-REC 3512 - 3545
097	Intervenor-Respondent's Brief in Opposition to Petitioners' Amended Petition for Review of Preliminary Orders , February 7, 2024	REC 3096 – 3152 C-REC 3546 - 3602
098	Joint Motion to Supplement Record with DEQ Response to EPA Letter , February 7, 2024	REC 3153 – 3159 C-REC 3603 - 3609
099	Declaration of Tiffany Floyd in Support of Joint Motion to Supplement Record with DEQ Response to EPA Letter , February 7, 2024	REC 3160 – 3196 C-REC 3610 - 3646
100	Petitioners' Reply Brief in Support of Amended Petition for Review of Preliminary Orders , February 14, 2024	REC 3197 – 3222 C-REC 3647 - 3672
101	Petitioners' Opposition to DEQ and Perpetua's Joint Motion to Supplement Record with DEQ Response to EPA Letter , February 21, 2024	REC 3223 – 3227 C-REC 3673 - 3677
102	Joint Motion to Supplement Record with March 12, 2024 EPA Letter , March 13, 2024	REC 3228 – 3232 C-REC 3678 - 3682
103	Declaration of Tiffany Floyd in Support of Joint Motion to Supplement Record with March 12, 2024 EPA Letter , March 13, 2024	REC 3233 – 3238 C-REC 3683 - 3688

104	Notice of Special Meeting of the Board of Environmental Quality April 8, 2024 , March 22, 2024	REC 3239 – 3241 C-REC 3689 - 3691
105	Notice of Special Meeting of the Board of Environmental Quality May 1, 2024 , March 22, 2024	REC 3242 – 3244 C-REC 3692 - 3694
106	Final Order , May 9, 2024	REC 3695 – 3720
107	Petitioners’ Motion for Clarification and/or Reconsideration , May 23, 2024	REC 3721 - 3727
108	Joint Motion for Reconsideration and/or Clarification of Final Order , May 23, 2024	REC 3728 - 3730
109	Memorandum in Support of Joint Motion for Reconsideration and/or Clarification of Final Order , May 23, 2024	REC 3731 - 3751
110	Notice of Special Meeting of the Board of Environmental Quality May 29, 2024 , May 24, 2024	REC 3752 - 3753
111	Notice of Special Meeting of the Board of Environmental Quality June 12, 2024 , June 3, 2024	REC 3754 - 3756
112	Petitioners’ Response Opposing DEQ/Perpetua’s Motion for Reconsideration , June 3, 2024	REC 3757 - 3761
113	Declaration of William Tiedemann , June 3, 2024	REC 3762 - 3822
114	Joint Motion to Strike Petitioners’ Response , June 4, 2024	REC 3823 - 3827
115	Notice of Appearance , June 5, 2024	REC 3828 - 3830
116	Petitioners’ Response Opposing DEQ/Perpetua’s Motion to Strike , June 7, 2024	REC 3831 - 3834
117	Order on Petitions for Reconsideration and/or Clarification of Final Order , June 12, 2024	REC 3835 – 3843
118	Notice of Status and Scheduling Conference; Updated Disclosure , June 24, 2024	REC 3844 - 3848

119	Idaho Department of Environmental Quality’s Initial Status Report , July 1, 2024	REC 3849 - 3854
120	Intervenor-Respondent’s Status Report , July 1, 2024	REC 3855 - 3860
121	Petitioners’ Status Report , July 1, 2024	REC 3861 - 3866
122	Scheduling Order , July 8, 2024	REC 3867 - 3872
123	Expert Declaration of Norka E. Paden, Ph.D. , August 13, 2024	REC 3873 - 3916
124	Expert Declaration of Kevin Schilling , August 13, 2024	REC 3917 - 4122
125	Notice of Appearance , August 29, 2024	REC 4123 - 4125
126	Notice of Expert Declarations , August 30, 2024	REC 4126 - 4128
127	Expert Declaration of Kevin Lewis , August 30, 2024	REC 4129 - 4276
128	Expert Declaration of Theresa Lopez , August 30, 2024	REC 4277 - 4318
129	Documents identified in Expert Declaration of Theresa Lopez, Attachment A of Memorandum in Support of Declaration , August 30, 2024	REC 4319 - 6009
130	Notice Re: Declaration of Norka E. Paden, Ph.D. , September 10, 2024	REC 6010 - 6039
131	Letter to Hearing Officer Lawrence Re Perpetua Resources Idaho, Inc. Expert Declarations , September 11, 2024	REC 6040
132	Amended Scheduling Order , September 17, 2024	REC 6041 - 6043
133	Letter to Hearing Officer Lawrence Re Department of Environmental Quality’s Expert Declarations , September 24, 2024	REC 6044
134	Second Amended Scheduling Order and Notice of Hearing , September 25, 2024	REC 6045 - 6047
135	Expert Declaration of William Tiedemann , October 4, 2024	REC 6048 - 6099

136	Expert Declaration of Ian H. von Lindern, P.E., Ph.D. , October 4, 2024	REC 6100 - 6891